

Received Date : 07-Jul-2016

Accepted Date : 07-Jul-2016

Article type : Editorial

TITLE: The general results of the RN4CAST survey in Italy

Authors:

Loredana SASSO, MEdSc, MSN, RN
Associate Professor of Nursing
Department of Health Sciences Department
University of Genoa,
Via Pastore, 1
16132 Genoa, Italy
Tel. 0039 010 3538519
Email: l.sasso@unige.it

Annamaria BAGNASCO, PhD, MEdSc, MSN, RN
Assistant Professor & Education Coordinator,
Department of Health Sciences,
University of Genoa,
Via Pastore, 1
16132 Genoa, Italy
Tel. 0039 010 3538519
Email: annamaria.bagnasco@unige.it

Milko ZANINI, PhD, MSN, MSoc, RN
Research Fellow & Lecturer
Department of Health Sciences,
University of Genoa,
Via Pastore 1,
I-16132 Genoa, Italy.
Tel. 0039 010 3538513
Email: milko.zanini@me.com

Gianluca CATANIA, PhD, MSN, RN
Research Fellow & Lecturer
Department of Health Sciences,
University of Genoa,

This article has been accepted for publication and undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the Version of Record. Please cite this article as doi: 10.1111/jan.13066

This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved.

Via Pastore, 1,
I-16132 Genoa, Italy.
Tel. 0039 010 3538513
Email: gianluca.catania@edu.unige.it

Giuseppe ALEO, PhD, MA
Research Fellow & Lecturer
Department of Health Sciences,
University of Genoa,
Via Pastore, 1,
I-16132 Genoa, Italy.
Tel. 0039 010 3538513
Email: giuseppe.aleo@edu.unige.it

Antonietta SANTULLO, MSN, RN
PhD Student in Nursing Research Methodology
Head of the Department of Education and Organizational Development
Romagna Local Health Authority,
Via De Gasperi 8
I-48121 Ravenna, Italy.
Tel. 0039 0541 707845
Email: antonietta.santullo@auslromagna.it

Federico SPANDONARO
Professor of Economy
University of Rome Tor Vergata.
Via Columbia 2
I-00133 Rome, Italy
Tel. 0039 06 72595643
Email: federico.spandonaro@uniroma2.it

Giancarlo ICARDI, MD
Full Professor
Director of the Department of Health Sciences
University of Genoa,
Via Pastore, 1
16132 Genoa, Italy
Tel. 0039 010 3538523
Email: icardi@unige.it

Roger WATSON, Ph.D., RN, FRCN, FAAN
Editor-in-Chief, *JAN*
Full Professor of Nursing
University of Hull
Location: University of Hull, UK, HU6 7RX
Mobile +447808480547
Fax: +44 (0) 1482 464695
Email: R.Watson@hull.ac.uk

Walter SERMEUS, PhD, RN,
RN4CAST Project Coordinator
Full Professor KU Leuven
Department of Public Health & Primary Care
Kapucijnenvoer 35
B-3000 Leuven
Tel. +32 16 373349
E-mail: walter.sermeus@med.kuleuven.be

Corresponding Author

Annamaria BAGNASCO, RN, MSN,
PhD in Nursing Research Methodology
Researcher in Nursing & Education Coordinator,
Department of Health Sciences,
University of Genoa,
Via Pastore, 1
16132 Genoa, Italy
Tel. 0039 010 3538519
Fax 0039 010 3535278
Email: annamaria.bagnasco@unige.it

Acknowledgements

We thank the RN4CAST consortium, funded by European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007–2013, grant agreement no. 223468) to make the design and instruments available for replication in Italy. We thank all the 800 nurses and nursing directors who participated in this study as local facilitators.

Funding

This study was funded by the Liguria Regional Government, NurSind, and Associazione Nazionale Infermieri Medicina Ospedaliera.

Conflict of Interest

Roger Watson is a Visiting Professor at the University of Genoa.

JAN Editorial

The general results of the RN4CAST survey in Italy

The issue of health workforce shortage and in particular of nurses, has been debated globally for almost three decades (Aiken & Mullinix 1987, Aiken *et al.* 1996, 2001, 2010), and has been exacerbated by the recent global financial crisis. The European RN4CAST project has

Accepted Article

shifted focus from considering only nursing workforce planning and workforce volumes to considering the impact of adequate nurse-patient ratios and work environment on patient safety and the quality of care (Sermeus *et al.* 2011). The common RN4CAST international protocol (Sermeus *et al.* 2011) enables data to be analysed and compared with those of other 13 countries European countries.

Italy became a partner of the RN4CAST European Consortium in 2013 (Sasso *et al.* 2016), thus becoming the 14th country to participate in this study. Data collection took place from September - December 2015 across Italy, involving 13 Regions, 40 hospitals, 292 units of general medicine and surgery, 3716 patients, and 3667 nurses. It is important to note that in Italy, the three-year baccalaureate degree has been the entry-level requirement for nursing practice since 1999.

Italy's hospital patient-nurse staffing ratio was shown to be 9.5 patients per nurse, which was higher than the average of approximately eight patients per nurse reported by other European countries (Aiken 2012, Ausserhoffer *et al.* 2014). This is significant if we consider that each additional surgical patient per nurse results in a 7% increase in the likelihood of dying within 30 days of admission, a 23% increase in burnout, and a 15% increase of job dissatisfaction (Aiken *et al.* 2002, Aiken *et al.* 2014). This implies that in Italian hospitals where each nurse cares for an average of nine surgical patients, the risk of mortality is 21% higher than those where nurses care for six patients. However, data collection needs to be finalized before this can be definitely confirmed.

Linked to patient safety and the quality of care is also the concept of 'care left undone'. Care left undone or missed nursing care refers to 'any aspect of required patient care that is omitted (either in part or in whole) or delayed. Missed care is an error of omission' (Kalish *et al.* 2009). Care left undone has been identified as a factor that mediates the relationship

between nurse staffing and patient outcomes, and the chances of care being left undone are halved when nurses care for six patients compared with when they care for ten patients (Ball *et al.* 2016). In the Italian RN4CAST study, the patient care activities mostly left undone (mean 41%) included oral hygiene, frequently change patient's position, comfort/dialogue with patients, patient and family education, developing or updating care plan, appropriate patient surveillance, and planning care. This result also shows that Italian nurses mainly tend to leave undone relational, communication, educational and planning activities, which instead are the ones that mostly distinguish nursing competencies from those of other health professionals, and are obliged to conduct purely practical activities such as administering painkillers, treatment and procedures, and documentation of nursing care.

In the Italian RN4CAST study, 36% of the nurses reported that, if they had the opportunity, they would abandon their profession within the next 12 months and the mean age of these nurses was 41 years, and not those who were close to retirement. Considering Italy's high patient-nurse staffing ratio, this confirmed the findings of Aiken *et al.* (2014), whereby each additional surgical patient per nurse results in a 15% increase in job dissatisfaction. Job dissatisfaction is also influenced by the work environment, which leads to burnout in 38.5% of the Italian nurses, mostly caused by poor professional autonomy, the lack of educational and career opportunities, and low salaries.

These factors negatively influenced way Italian nurses perceived their roles and their professional identity, but did not greatly affect the way patients perceived the quality of care they received. In fact, 65% of the patients reported that they would definitely recommend the hospital they were admitted to friends and relatives, and 78% of declared that they were listened and respected by nurses. This shows that, notwithstanding the great difficulties,

Italian nurses on a daily basis work make an enormous effort to ensure the best possible care but at their own expense in terms of burnout and dissatisfaction.

The RN4CAST@IT study has demonstrated that in Italy there are high patient to nurse workloads in hospitals that are posing risks for patient safety, and negatively impacting on the quality of care and on nurse retention, particularly due to excessive workloads, burnout, and job dissatisfaction. This was also confirmed by the fact that nurses missed more than 40% of the care required for patients during their stay in hospital. Moreover, missed care mostly involved activities that reinforce nurses' professional identity, based on autonomy, decision-making, accountability, and leadership (Sandström *et al.* 2011).

Better patient-nurses ratios could significantly improve patient safety and the organization and the quality of care in hospitals. In 1999, California passed legislation mandating that hospitals must have at least one nurse for every six medical and surgical patients (Aiken *et al.* 2002), and the first state to implement minimum patient to nurse staffing ratios in acute hospitals (Coffman *et al.* 2002, Spetz 2004). Today, due to high patient to nurse ratios in Italy nurses often do not have the time to implement appropriate discharge plans. This leads to higher readmission rates that increase healthcare workload and costs.

Nevertheless, due to the global financial crisis, in the attempt to abide by strict spending review policies hospital managers expected to save money by freezing the hiring of new nurses and increased the patient to nurse ratios. The RN4CAST study on the contrary has confirmed that nurses are not the problem of health systems, but the solution, and this was also reinforced by the patients' perceptions of the care they received from the nurses.

Thanks to the evidence provided by the RN4CAST study also in Italy, nursing leaders now have the evidence and the means necessary to play a stronger role in implementing strategies to improve patient to nurse ratios, and create better working environments to ensure high quality care, improve

patient safety and job satisfaction. Job satisfaction is very important to reduce burnout and improve retention. In Wales, the Nurse Staffing Levels Act became law on 21 March 2016, and recently, Nicola Sturgeon, First Minister of Scotland announced that ‘Scotland will be next to introduce nurse staffing legislation’ (*Nursing Times* 19 June 2016). Now, also thanks to the RN4CAST@IT study, we hope that the positive wave of change that started in Wales and Scotland for nurses will soon reach also Italy.

Acknowledgements

We thank the RN4CAST consortium, funded by European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007–2013, grant agreement no. 223468) to make the design and instruments available for replication in Italy. We thank all the nurses and nursing directors who participated in this study as local facilitators.

We also thank the Liguria Regional Government, NurSind, and Associazione Nazionale Infermieri Medicina Ospedaliera, for funding this study.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

- Aiken L.H. & Mullinix C.F. (1987) The Nurse Shortage: Myth or Reality? *New England Journal of Medicine* 317, 641–646.
- Aiken L.H., Sochalski J, & Anderson G.F. (1996) Downsizing the Hospital Workforce. *Health Affairs* 15, 88–92.

Aiken L.H., Clarke S.P., Sloane D.M., Sochalski J., Busse R., Clarke H., Giovannetti P., Hunt J., Rafferty A.M., & Shamian J. (2001) Nurses' Reports of Hospital Quality of Care and Working Conditions in Five Countries. *Health Affairs* 20, 43–53.

Aiken L.H., Clarke S.P., Sloane D.M., Sochalski J. & Silber J.H. (2002) Hospital nurse staffing and patient mortality, nurse burnout, and job dissatisfaction. *JAMA* 288, 1987-1993.

Aiken L.H., Sloane D.M., Cimiotti J.P., Clarke S.P., Flynn L., Seago J.A., Spetz J. & Smith, H.L. (2010) Implications of the California nurse staffing mandate for other states. *Health services research* 45, 904-921.

Aiken, L. H., Sermeus, W., Van den Heede, K., Sloane, D. M., Busse, R., McKee, M., Bruyneel L., Rafferty A.M., Griffiths P., Moreno-Casbas M.T., Tishelman C., Scott A., Brzostek T., Kinnunen J., Schwendimann R., Heinen M., Zikos D., Strømseng Sjetne I., Smith H.L. & Kutney-Lee Ann. (2012) Patient safety, satisfaction, and quality of hospital care: cross sectional surveys of nurses and patients in 12 countries in Europe and the United States. *BMJ* 344, e1717.

Aiken L.H., Sloane D.M., Bruyneel L., Van den Heede K., Griffiths P., Busse R., Diomidous M., Kinnunen J., Kozka M., Lesaffre E., McHugh M.D., Moreno-Casbas M.T., Rafferty A.M., Schwendimann R., Scott A., Tishelman C., van Achterberg T. & Sermeus W. (2014) Nurse staffing and education and hospital mortality in nine European countries: a retrospective observational study. *The Lancet* 383, 1824–1830.

Ausserhofer D., Zander B., Busse R., Schubert M., De Geest S., Rafferty A.M., Ball J., Scott A., Kinnunen J., Heinen M., Strømseng Sjetne I., Moreno-Casbas M.T., Kozka M., Lindqvist R., Diomidous M., Bruyneel L., Sermeus W., Aiken L.H. & Schwendimann R. (2014). Prevalence, patterns and predictors of nursing care left undone in European hospitals: results from the multicountry cross-sectional RN4CAST study. *BMJ Quality & Safety* 23, 126-135.

Ball J. E., Griffiths P., Rafferty A.M., Lindqvist R., Murrells T. & Tishelman C. (2016) A cross-sectional study of 'care left undone' on nursing shifts in hospitals. *Journal of Advanced*

Nursing. DOI: 10.1111/jan.12976

Coffman J.M., Seago J.A. & Spetz J. (2002) Minimum Nurse-to-Patient Ratios in Acute Care Hospitals in California. *Health Affairs* 21, 53–64.

Kalisch B.J., Landstrom G.L. & Hinshaw A.S. (2009) Missed nursing care: a concept analysis. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 65, 1509-1517.

Sandström B., Borglin G., Nilsson R. & Willman A. (2011) Promoting the implementation of evidence-based practice: A literature review focusing on the role of nursing leadership. *Worldviews on Evidence-Based Nursing* 8, 212-223.

Sasso L., Bagnasco A., Zanini M., Catania G., Aleo G., Santullo A., Spandonaro F., Icardi G., Watson R. & Sermeus W. (2016) RN4CAST@IT: why is it important for Italy to take part in the RN4CAST project? *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 72, 485–487. doi: 10.1111/jan.12709.

Sermeus W., Aiken L.H., Van den Heede K., Rafferty A.M., Griffiths P., Moreno-Casbas M.T., Busse R., Lindqvist R., Scott A.P., Bruyneel L., Brzostek T., Kinnunen J., Schubert M., Schoonhoven L. & Zikos, D. (2011). Nurse forecasting in Europe (RN4CAST): Rationale, design and methodology. *BMC Nursing* 10, 6.

Spetz J. (2004) California's Minimum Nurse-to-Patient Ratios: The First Few Months. *Journal of Nursing Administration* 34, 571–578.